
From: Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

To: Tessler, David

CC: Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (El&E); Mary Abrams; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (El&E);

Takano, Leilani; Jacqueline Flores; Scarborough, Jennifer CTR OASN (EI&E);

(b) (6)

Sent: 4/11/2016 12:53:38 PM

Subject: RE: [Non-DoD Source] Re: Tuberolabium guamense orchids

Dave.

Have you and your team had a chance to review the information we provided? Do you need any further clarification? I ask because we are getting inquiries from all over about the status of the consultation. Please let me know if you would like to meet to discuss any of the information presented or need further clarification.

Thank you.

Coralie

----Original Message-----

From: Tessler, David [mailto: (b) (6)

Sent: Friday, April 08, 2016 4:40 PM

To: Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

Cc: Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E); Mary Abrams; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (EI&E); Takano, Leilani; Jacqueline

Flores; Scarborough, Jennifer CTR OASN (EI&E); (b) (6)

Subject: Re: [Non-DoD Source] Re: Tuberolabium guamense orchids

Coralie.

Thanks for trying to schedule something, but that date wont work for us regardless.

We will get back to you to request a meeting if we need further clarification.

David

David F. Tessler

Deputy Field Supervisor for Geographic Operations U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office 300 Ala Moana Blvd., Suite 3-122

Honolulu, HI 96850

Email: (b) (6) Office: 808-792-9471

Cell: (b) (6) Fax: 808-792-9581

Web: https://www.fws.gov/pacificislands/index.html http://www.fws.gov/pacificislands>

On Fri, Apr 8, 2016 at 11:31 AM, Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV <coralie.cobb@navy.mil> wrote:

David,

In an effort to continue to move this process, I have scheduled a meeting on Monday, April 11th (Tuesday, April 12th for Guam) to discuss any questions or clarifications on the information we have provided you today. If your office has no further questions regarding the proposed action, we can cancel the meeting on Monday.

Thank you. Coralie

From: Tessler, David [mailto: (b) (

Sent: Friday, April 08, 2016 1:50 PM
To: Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

Cc: Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E); Mary Abrams; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (EI&E); Takano, Leilani; Jacqueline

Flores; Scarborough, Jennifer CTR OASN (EI&E); (b) (6)

Subject: Re: [Non-DoD Source] Re: Tuberolabium guamense orchids

Thank you Coralie,

I will discuss these clarifications with our biologists in Guam and here in Honolulu. If we need additional clarification or have questions we will let you know early next week.

In the meantime, I hope you are all able to enjoy the weekend.

Regards,

David

David F. Tessler

Deputy Field Supervisor for Geographic Operations U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office 300 Ala Moana Blvd., Suite 3-122

Honolulu, HI 96850

Email: (b) (6) Office: 808-792-9471

Cell: (b) (6)
Fax: 808-792-9581

Web: https://www.fws.gov/pacificislands/index.html http://www.fws.gov/pacificislands>

On Fri, Apr 8, 2016 at 6:02 AM, Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV < (b) (6) wrote:

Dave.

As requested during our call on Tuesday, April 5, 2016, we have updated our response on the Tuberolabium guamense and Mariana eight spot butterfly (attached).

We have updated the numbers of orchids located during recent surveys on Department of Defense (DoD) lands (a total of approximately 7,301) and we are able to avoid approximately 2,276 TuGu (31.2%) on DoD lands. In addition, we have modified our scope of work for orchid salvage to include the salvage of 2,000 TuGu.

As for the Mariana eight spot butterfly, we have provided information on the host plants and butterfly data to reflect the survey results regarding "occupancy." The host plants and butterfly data from the northwest corner of the MPMG range came from the Threatened and Endangered Species and Migratory Birds Monitoring Report prepared by HDR. According to the maps in the report, one adult Mariana eight spot butterfly was observed, two of the Elatostema were occupied and one Procris was occupied. The remaining host plants were not occupied.

In addition, the results of the surveys conducted by the University of Guam in 2013 indicate they spotted one adult on tree in the area of the MPMG range on July 5, 2013. Six points were identified where 6 chrysalides of H. octocula marianensis? were found on Procris pedunculata and 3 incomplete and 1 smooth chrysalis of H. octocula marianensis were found on Procris pedunculata on April 2, 2013.

If you would like to have a call to discuss the information presented in this e-mail, we would be happy to do so at your earliest convenience.

Coralie

Coralie Cobb

Senior Natural Resources Specialist

Naval Facilities Engineering Command, Southwest

Tel ?: (720) 542-3085

"It's not about what it is, it's about what it can become."

----Original Message-----

From: Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

Sent: Thursday, March 31, 2016 7:55 PM

To: 'Tessler, David': Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E)

Cc: 'Mary Abrams'; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (EI&E); Takano, Leilani; Jacqueline Flores; Scarborough, Jennifer CTR OASN (EI&E)

Subject: RE: [Non-DoD Source] Re: Tuberolabium guamense orchids

Dave,

We have been compiling the data from the various surveys and information received from our engineers on the proposed action. The attached Word document addresses the items you mentioned in your e-mail regarding the Tuberolabium guamense and Mariana eight spot butterfly. The attached figures depict the location of our proposed action in relation to the locations of the Tuberolabium guamense (Figure 1) and Mariana eight spot butterfly (Figure 2).

If you would like to have a call to discuss the information presented in this e-mail, we would be happy to do so at your earliest convenience.

Thank you.

Coralie

Coralie Cobb

Senior Natural Resources Specialist

Naval Facilities Engineering Command, Southwest

Tel ?: (720) 542-3085

"It's not about what it is, it's about what it can become."

----Original Message-----

From: Tessler, David [mailto:(b) (6)

Sent: Wednesday, March 30, 2016 2:11 PM To: Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E)

Cc: Mary Abrams; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (EI&E); Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

Subject: [Non-DoD Source] Re: Tuberolabium guamense orchids

Hello Joe and all;

It is important to clarify these numbers so we can know exactly how to integrate them into our analyses. What you have sent thus far in these two brief emails is difficult to make clear sense of and does not constitute a sufficient basis for finalizing the analyses for this species. I would like to be 100% clear in terms of what DON is saying about the impacts of the proposed action because the consequences will be significant either way. This information is insufficient as it stands. Can we have a call or another email clearly stating: 1) the total number of T. Guamense that have been found by DON/JRM in their surveys; 2) where they have been found relative to the described action; 3), and how many T. guamense will not be avoided and in which specific areas. This really needs to be articulated clearly and it seems that maps would be vital supporting documents.

Also, there was no mention in your two emails of any changes to the machine gun LFTR for the Mariana eight spot butterfly host plants. You had mentioned on the phone on Thursday that DON was going to alter the impact area to avoid any loss, but we will need to have that in writing and ideally on maps as well. If this is not the case, that will need to be clearly stated as well. Before we proceed with these analyses, we really need to make sure all parties are completely clear on these points. We do not

want to make any mistakes.

Thanks and I look forward to hearing from you, or another authoritative party on these issues.

Best Regards,

David

David F. Tessler

Deputy Field Supervisor for Geographic Operations U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office 300 Ala Moana Blvd., Suite 3-122

Honolulu, HI 96850

Email: (b) (6)

Office: 808-792-9471 Cell: (b) (6) Fax: 808-792-9581

Web: https://www.fws.gov/pacificislands/index.html <http://www.fws.gov/pacificislands>

On Wed, Mar 30, 2016 at 6:39 AM, Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E) (b) (6) wrote:

Dave,

Here's the Wednesday orchid update.

We have found an additional 472 orchids that we can avoid. So the new total number of Tuberolabium Guamense that we can avoid is 1.878 individuals.

Please enter that into your analysis.

Thanks Joe

Captain Joe Campbell

From: Campbell, Joseph A CAPT OASN (EI&E) Sent: Tuesday, March 29, 2016 6:24:06 AM

To: 'David Tessler'

Cc: Mary Abrams; MINOTT, Karrin H CIV OASN (EI&E); Cobb, Coralie H CIV NAVFAC SW, SWEV

Subject: Tuberolabium guamence orchids

Dave,

Sorry that we did not connect by phone Friday or Monday. I'd like to tell you that we'll be able to avoid 300 T. guamence in the project footprint and 1106 T. guamence outside the project footprint. We are continuing our survey for the orchid and I'll update this number for you Wednesday if we determine that we are able to avoid additional orchids.

That would be a total of 1406 orchids avoided.

Thanks for considering this input in your analysis.

Joe

Very Respectfully,

Captain Joseph A. Campbell

Office of the Assistant Secretary of the Navy (EI&E)

703.602.3924